

ASHTABULA CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF ASHTABULA – COUNCIL CHAMBERS
4717 Main Avenue, Ashtabula, OH 44004

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Monday, October 21, 2019

CALL TO ORDER

The President of Council called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m., the Ward 2 Councilor offered the opening prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

MOMENT OF SILENCE

A moment of silence was observed for Mrs. Palmina Benedict who passed away October 15, two days before her 97th birthday. She began her career with the City of Ashtabula in 1959 and retired in 1983. She served as the Clerk of the Recreational & Forestry Department, Principal Clerk Stenographer and the Executive Secretary for the City Manager's office, Clerk/Typist and Deputy Registrar in the Health Department.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Mr. August A. Pugliese	(Ward 2 Councilor)
	Mr. Richard A. Quaranta	(Ward 3 Councilor)
	Mr. Michael D. Speelman	(Ward 4 Councilor)
	Ms. Jane E. Haines	(Ward 5 Councilor)
	Mrs. Kym A. Foglio	(Ward 1 Councilor)
	Mr. Christopher J. McClure	(Vice President)
	Mr. John S. Roskovics	(President)

MEMBER(S) ABSENT: None

OFFICER(S) PRESENT:	Mr. James M. Timonere	(City Manager)
	Mr. Michael Franklin	(City Solicitor)
	Ms. Traci R. Welch	(Director of Finance)
	Mrs. LaVette E. Hennigan, MMC	(Clerk of Council)
	Mrs. Stacy H. Senskey	(Clerk of Council)

(NOTE: Clerk Hennigan will remain on staff until January 1, 2020, to provide instructions to Clerk Senskey on the duties and responsibilities of the Office of the Clerk of Council.)

OFFICER(S) ABSENT: None

EXCUSED ABSENCE(S): None

SUNSHINE LAW: Clerk of Council Senskey certified conformity to the Ohio Sunshine Law.

PRESENTATION(S)

On behalf of City Council and members of the Administration seated at the dais, Clerk Hennigan, accompanied by the Council President, presented the following commemorative resolution to the Ward 2 Councilor:

RESOLUTION NO. 2019-112

**A RESOLUTION DEDICATING AND NAMING THE SECOND FLOOR
CONFERENCE ROOM IN THE ASHTABULA MUNICIPAL BUILDING AS THE
“AUGUST A. PUGLIESE CONFERENCE ROOM”**

WHEREAS, former City Manager August A. Pugliese has announced his retirement from his current office of Ward Two Councilor as of November 30, 2019; and

WHEREAS, it has come to the attention of the Council and Public Officers of the City of Ashtabula, Ohio, that August A. Pugliese has performed services for this community since 1959 which deserve special recognition; and

WHEREAS, August A. Pugliese, affectionately known to one and all as Augie, is recognized and respected for his contributions to the advancement of the interests of the people of Ashtabula, Ohio, since he began his career in public service; and

WHEREAS, Mr. Pugliese has worked for and represented the citizens of his community in numerous capacities, including:

Engineering Department: November 15, 1959 to February 28, 1997, in the positions of:
Inspector
Rodman
Transitman
Surveyor Forman (officially termed “Party Leader”)
Engineering Technician
Civil Engineer
Supervisor
City Manager: December 1, 1999 to February 2, 2005
Ward 2 Councilor: August 19, 2009 to November 30, 2019; and

WHEREAS, August A. Pugliese is well known as a tireless advocate and passionate spokesman for the City he has served so long and so well, and his experience and guidance will be missed in Council’s future deliberations;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this City Council and these Public Officers of the City of Ashtabula, Ohio, do hereby ceremonially acknowledge the passage of Resolution No. 2019-112 on Monday, September 16, 2019, that dedicated and named the second floor conference room in the Ashtabula Municipal Building as the “August A. Pugliese Conference Room”, as a gesture of respect and appreciation to Mr. Pugliese, and in remembrance of his years of service to the City of Ashtabula - the one and only place he has called home.

The Councilor’s wife, Judy Pugliese, was asked to join him to unveil the plaque that will be displayed above the entrance to the August A. Pugliese Conference Room located on the second floor of the Ashtabula City Municipal Building. The President mentioned it is a room where City Council regularly meets, as well as community groups.

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

The President expressed his thankfulness to his colleague, and said, "He knows the City like the back of his hand; and we are really losing a valuable asset and a good guy and friend."

The Ward 3 Councilor declared, "Now we can tell Augie, 'Go to your room.'" The Councilor expressed his thankfulness to everyone, and said, "I have mixed emotions. I'm quite honored with such an honor and would like to thank City Council, City Solicitor, Mr. Timonere and everyone that has supported me all these years. I also want to thank the most important part of my life, my family – my beautiful wife Judy, my daughters Amy and Ann, my sons Rick and Augie, my grandchildren," whom he named one by one. "It takes a lot sometimes to be a politician, as everyone knows – as we can see here tonight (*see Public Discussion/Comments – General Matters*). Sometimes there are problems you cannot handle. But most of the time, we will do everything we can to try to make everyone happy. It could be fifty/fifty, let's put it that way. If we can come out with a deal, with fifty/fifty, it's a victory. I want to thank everyone once again. And I don't want to say goodbye, I want to say see you later."

After much applause and a standing ovation, the City Manager remarked, "You have been a tremendous asset to me and to my administration. As Mr. Roskovichs alluded to, there's been several times where we've been out on job sites and we've said, 'Hey, let's just call, let's just call Augie.'" He expressed his appreciation for the Councilor's support dedication, knowledge and experience, all of which have been invaluable to him throughout the years, adding, "I truly am going to miss you."

The Vice President added, "All I can say is, I'll see you at McDonald's." "The best thing on this Council has been the friendships that I've made and you are top of the list."

The President reiterated where the plaque will hang for everyone to see. He commented that he appreciates how the Clerks have already begun to use the new name of the conference room, so "Augie will always be with this Council and Councils to come, in spirit."

The Ward 2 Councilor said, "I just would like to thank a couple more people. They've been instrumental in my career and that's Mrs. Hennigan; and Stacy who just came aboard and wish her all the luck in the world; and of course Traci, our Finance Director who's getting things together for next year."

The President gave a brief overview of how the meeting would proceed, from this point forward, to give attendees guidance and let them know they would be heard during the "Public Discussion/Comment – General Matters" portion of the meeting.

EXECUTIVE SESSION:

Mr. Pugliese moved, Mr. Quaranta seconded to convene an Executive Session before adjourning the public portion of the meeting to discuss Personnel Compensation and Sale of Property. On the roll call to convene the Executive Session: Mr. Pugliese, Mr. Quaranta, Mr. Speelman, Ms. Haines, Mrs. Foglio, Mr. McClure, Mr. Roskovichs voted aye; motion CARRIED.

CONSENT AGENDA

The Consent Agenda is a means whereby Council is able to efficiently conduct business by grouping routine items for consideration and disposal.

PRESENTATION OF MEETING MINUTES: None

LEGISLATION AGENDA - None

- Formal Legislation Request(s)
- Form and Correctness
- Legislation Overview
- Public Discussion (on legislation only)
- Reading

REGULAR BUSINESS AGENDA

PRESENTATION OF MEETING MINUTES: Clerk of Council Senskey presented the October 7, 2019, Regular City Council Meeting minutes. Mr. Pugliese moved, Mrs. Foglio seconded to waive the reading of the minutes; motion CARRIED. Hearing no corrections, the minutes were approved as presented.

ADMINISTRATIVE REPORTS and COMMUNICATIONS

CITY MANAGER

Trick or Treat

The City Manager reminded everyone Trick or Treat in the City of Ashtabula is Saturday November 2, from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. He explained that if Halloween (October 31) falls on Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday, Trick or Treat in Ashtabula City is held the Saturday before Halloween; if it falls on Thursday or Friday, Trick or Treat is held the Saturday after Halloween. Hosting Trick or Treat on Saturday seems to agree with most work schedules and student activities. The recent confusion stems from the townships doing something different than following our lead, which they have done in past years.

River Bend Hotel & Suites – Construction Update

The City Manager said because the temporary sign was removed from the site where the hotel will be constructed, assumptions were made that the hotel was no longer going to be built. He said the hotel is going to be constructed; that next week he is scheduled to meet with the developers to get a status update, and will give an update at the next regular council meeting.

Petmin USA Town Hall Meeting

The City Manager is hosting a Town Hall meeting Tuesday, October 29, at 6:00 p.m., in the Kent State Ashtabula Auditorium, to provide the public with project information and field audience questions. Representatives from Petmin, Growth Partnership and the City of Ashtabula will be on hand to discuss the facility's design, water discharge and EPA air permit; the Risberg Pipeline

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

impact on the project, economic growth for the City, he grants received for the roadway construction, among other details. He urged the community to attend.

New Tobacco Law

Ashtabula City Health Department representatives Christine Hill, Health Commissioner and Terri Collett, Environmental Health Director presented changes enacted on October 17, 2019, to Ohio Revised Code 2927.02 prohibiting the sale of tobacco and vaping products to anyone under the age of 21. The Codified Ordinances of the City of Ashtabula, Ohio Chapter 761 addresses the sale of tobacco products to minors. The representatives presented draft language that would update our codified ordinances to reflect the current laws. The Ward 2 Councilor asked if there have been any reports of vaping related illnesses in or around Ashtabula. Commissioner Hill indicated vaping-related illnesses are now reportable as severe lung conditions caused by vaping. She affirmed that Ashtabula City residents have fallen ill due to vaping. The Ashtabula City Health Department performs compliance checks at businesses licensed to sell tobacco products. There is a sliding scale of penalties for businesses that violate the law. The Commissioner said she believes in using the first violation as an opportunity to educate; therefore invites first time offenders to meet with her to establish plans for correction. They will also exercise their right to revoke licenses or issue fines. Most businesses are cooperative. Clerks selling tobacco products can be 18. Mrs. Foglio moved, Mr. McClure seconded to have legislation drafted to update Codified Ordinance Chapter 761; motion CARRIED.

CITY SOLICITOR

No Report

DIRECTOR OF FINANCE

The Director formally requested ORDINANCE NO. 2019-121 AN ORDINANCE TO MAKE SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS IN THE GENERAL, SANITATION, PERMANENT IMPROVEMENT, AND WORKERS' COMPENSATION FUNDS FOR CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES OF THE CITY OF ASHTABULA, STATE OF OHIO, FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2019 THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2019, for consideration this evening. Mrs. Foglio moved, Mr. Quaranta seconded to approve this request; motion CARRIED.

CLERK OF COUNCIL

No Report

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS and COMMUNICATIONS

Council committees meet in the August A. Pugliese Conference Room – M.B. 2nd Floor
(Chair/Vice Chair)

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT/ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT/PARKS & RECREATION (CD/ED/P&R)

(Haines/Quaranta)

The Vice Chair reported on the committee's October 6, meeting, as follows: Guest speakers were Ashtabula County Realtors Bruce Schlosser and James Paulchel. The Highlights were:

- Real Estate Markets throughout the County are stable
- Average sale price in the County is \$126,700 – up 10.6% across the county

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

- Median sale price in the County is \$114,900 – up almost 21% across the county
- Average sale price in the City is \$79,500 - up 19%
- Median sale price in the City is \$64,900
- Crime and Schools were given as reasons home buyers are not looking in the City
- There are people who believe some of the houses should be saved and rehabbed instead of demolished
- The Ashtabula County Land Reutilization Corporation (a.k.a., Land Bank) used Neighborhood Improvement Program funds to remove over 170 blighted City structures, which raised surrounding home values
- The City is currently at 62% non-owner occupied; any time you go over a 50/50 ratio, it is almost irreversible
- Millennials prefer to rent than buy property
- The average rent in our City is \$635 per month; however currently it is cheaper to own than rent
- A \$70,000 mortgage at 30 years with 10% down = \$301 principal and interest payment/month; a 15 year mortgage increases the monthly payment to \$466

The committee's next meeting is Tuesday, November 12, at 4:00 p.m.

FINANCE & PERSONNEL - (F&P) (McClure/Pugliese)

The Chair announced the committee's next meeting is Friday, November 8, at 8:00 a.m.

PUBLIC WORKS/PUBLIC UTILITIES/CABLE/SCHOOLS - (PW/PU/C/S) (Pugliese/Roskovics)

The Chair announced the committee's scheduled meeting for Friday, November 1, cancelled.

SAFETY FORCES - (SF) (Speelman/Foglio)

The Chair announced the committee's next meeting is Monday, October 28, at 8:00 a.m.

LEGISLATION AGENDA

- Formal Legislation Request(s): None
- Form and Correctness: Satisfied
- Overview: Clerk Senskey provided a brief overview of the legislation to be considered.
- Public Discussion (Legislation Only): None

Consent Agenda Format

Mr. McClure moved, Mrs. Foglio seconded to dispose of the Regular Business Legislation by Consent Agenda; motion CARRIED.

Reading

Clerk of Council Senskey presented the following legislation for Council's consideration:

ORDINANCE NO. 2019-119, AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH MNJ TECHNOLOGIES DIRECT, INC. FOR COMPUTER EQUIPMENT AND SOFTWARE IN THE AMOUNT OF \$27,379.25. (City Manager)

ORDINANCE NO. 2019-120, AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO DISPOSE OF OBSOLETE AND UNNEEDED VEHICLES AND EQUIPMENT. (City Manager)

ORDINANCE NO. 2019-121, AN ORDINANCE TO MAKE SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATIONS IN THE GENERAL, SANITATION, PERMANENT IMPROVEMENT, AND WORKERS' COMPENSATION FUNDS FOR CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES OF THE CITY OF ASHTABULA, STATE OF OHIO, FOR THE PERIOD JANUARY 1, 2019 THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2019. (Finance Director)

Mr. Pugliese moved, Mr. Quaranta seconded to waive the reading of the ordinances; motion CARRIED. Mr. Pugliese moved, Mrs. Foglio seconded to waive the Charter requirement of two readings. On the roll call to waive the Charter requirement of two readings: Mr. Pugliese, Mr. Quaranta, Mr. Speelman, Ms. Haines, Mrs. Foglio, Mr. McClure, Mr. Roskovics voted aye; motion CARRIED. On the roll call to adopt the ordinances: Mr. Pugliese, Mr. Quaranta, Mr. Speelman, Ms. Haines, Mrs. Foglio, Mr. McClure, Mr. Roskovics voted aye; motion CARRIED.

NEW BUSINESS

Tell Us Something We Don't Know

Ward 1 Councilor

- Congratulated the Ashtabula Chapter of Catholic Daughters of America who celebrated their 100th anniversary Saturday, October 19.
- Feed Our Vets Ashtabula organization held their grand opening October 19. They are located on Center Street in the old Red Cross Building. They are open the third Thursday of each month to any vet in need of food. The Ward 4 Councilor added vets should bring their DD214 and their ID to show proof of Veteran Status.
- Today, she and the City Manager attended the ribbon cutting for the Prospect Urgent Care in the old Ponderosa Building. They will be open 9:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m., seven days a week, starting November 1. On all holidays, they will be open 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. The City Manager reported the facility made agreement with Ashtabula County Medical Center in case additional care is needed.

Ward 2 Councilor

- Announced the importance of voting in favor of the upcoming paving levy. The streets are in very bad shape and everyone sees it is out of hand. It is a 4 mill levy for five years. It is up to residents if the levy passes or fails; we need your help. If you own a \$70,000 property, it would only cost an extra \$98 a year. The Manager added that the City spends between \$250,000 and \$400,000 a year which only permits small paving projects to be performed. He has applied for Small Cities Grant Funding to help supplement Permanent Improvement Funds. To pave Lake Avenue from (Route 20 to Bridge Street, alone, is estimated to cost \$2.1 million. The proposed paving levy is estimated to bring in \$775,000 a year. He will continue to seek grant funding to combine with yearly paving funds, along with revenue received if the electorate approves the paving levy that will appear on the November General Election ballot, to continue to address our roads.

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

Ward 5 Councilor

- Reminded citizens Voting Day is Tuesday, November 5, and is very important. She said another opportunity to cast a vote is to attend the Chili Cook-Off sponsored by My Neighborhood Collaborative Sunday, October 27, at noon, at St. Peter's Episcopal Church in downtown Ashtabula. The Councilor teased that votes may be cast for her superior chili over the President of Council's dish. Mr. Quaranta added that the event is free. Clerk. Senskey added she will also have a chili entry.

President of Council

- He visited the new Fresenius Kidney Care Dialysis Center located in the Lake Avenue Plaza. He said it is quite impressive, it takes up three store fronts and has state of the art equipment.

PUBLIC DISCUSSION/COMMENTS (General Matters)

Council Chambers was filled with people who spoke about our City's stray and feral cat population.

- The Manager began by dispelling the misinformation found on social media outlets and in newsprint. He explained the City receives five to ten calls a day about feral cats in the community causing damage to property. Owners of the property want to know what can be done. There is currently no legislation that prohibits a person from feeding cats on someone else's property besides calling it trespassing. No member of this City Council or City Administration said people should stop feeding cats or suggested the cats be euthanized or destroyed.
- The Ward 3 Councilor read a letter from Darlene Sietman, expressing her views in support of a Trap, Neuter, Release (TNR) Program as a way to address the community stray and feral cat population.
- The following representatives were present:
 - Animal Advocate Dr. Irene Fiala who is an expert on animal sociology, animal sheltering. She commented that the first cornerstone is education; letting people know how to access low cost spray/neuter; promoting the ideal of animal sentient, (*a creature that can suffer and feel pain; mostly animals and humans*), and that animals have the right to be here; humans are their providers and have domesticated cats and are responsible for them. She spoke of the "short term, the low hanging fruit education, and the long term Trap, Spay, Neuter (TNR) solution. The middle range is finding out exactly why people are unable to provide for their cat and focusing on creating those available resources. There are solutions and a lot of people are available to address the problems the City currently faces in terms of stray and feral cats.
 - Char Rao from Harbor Cat Rescue, a volunteer-run non-profit who has been rescuing cats for 14 years, using her own money, donations and fund raising
 - Sharon, who privately held fundraisers to offset costs of caring for stray and feral cats

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

- Vicki Kerestman, President of “What’s One More” Cat Sanctuary and Director of Ashtabula Low Cost Spay Neuter, in existence 15 years
 - Unni Heineking, Executive Director Animal Welfare Center of Ashtabula County
 - Leslie Lawrence, Director of Holy Cat Whiskers, Feral Cat and Stray Rescue, founded in 2004
 - Autumn Vigil, National and State registered Veterinary Technician for 22 years, and
 - Kim Fedler of Saybrook and Lori Zebrasky of Jefferson, voluntarily help the community cat population.
- Clerk Senskey announced sign up rosters are available for the Pre and Regular Council meetings; that she has heard from a few of the organizations present this evening; and encouraged persons to provide their name and email address for the purpose of coordinating efforts.
- The Vice President said, “I’m a big fan of non-government; and I’m a bigger fan of folks like you getting together and harnessing the power that’s in this room. You don’t need us to do that. I understand the form and your voice is being heard; and that’s what this is for. But, I think to leave this meeting – we’re going to do our thing and it’s going to be legislation. Legislation can only do what legislation can do. The education and taking this to the next several steps that it needs to go... that’s to organize and focus because the City provides the legislation. I think there’s so much good in here.” He enumerated the ideals put forth this evening and said, “There’s a point that government can’t do much and groups could form that could do a lot more. I would just encourage that; because I think that would go a lot further than the wheels of government, which tend to run pretty slow and pretty cumbersome; and dare I say ineffective.”

The President thank everyone for attending and helping to educate the dais; said this is the beginning of what we envision to be a long process; encouraged attendees to sign up for continued involved/participation and to network together.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

- **Convene:** The President announced the executive session would convene, that it would reconvene off camera, and asked the all members of City Council, the City Manager and the City Solicitor to attend.
- **Reconvene:** The President reconvened the public portion of the meeting, with no action taken.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further business to come before this Council, the President declared the meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Ashtabula City Council Regular Meeting Minutes
Monday, October 21, 2019

DATE APPROVED: November 4, 2019

ATTESTED BY: John S. Roskovics
John S. Roskovics, President of Council

ATTESTED BY: Stacy H. Senskey
Stacy H. Senskey, Clerk of Council

ATTESTED BY: Larlette E. Hennigan
Larlette E. Hennigan, MMC, Clerk of Council