

LEGAL NOTICE
City of Ashtabula
4400 Main Avenue Redevelopment
RFQ/RFP

The City of Ashtabula is seeking Request for Qualifications and Proposals (RFQ/RFP) from Real Estate Developers/Development Teams to redevelop the former Municipal Building located at 4400 Main Avenue, Ashtabula, OH 44004 in the City's Downtown District.

Sealed proposals will be received by the City Manager of the City of Ashtabula, Ohio, at his office in the Ashtabula Municipal Building, until 4:00 p.m. on April 19, 2024. Proposals should be captioned on the outside of the envelope 4400 Main Avenue Redevelopment.

Please contact the City Manager's office at 440-992-7183 to receive a copy of the information for the RFQ/RFP, or by email to bsanders@cityofashtabula.com

The City reserves the right to reject any or all proposals, to waive any informalities or irregularities in the proposals received and to accept any proposal which is deemed most favorable to the City of Ashtabula

The City is an Equal Opportunity Employer.
The City of Ashtabula, Ohio
James Timonere
Ashtabula City Manager

Publish: February 9, 2024 and February 16, 2024

REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS & PROPOSALS



City of Ashtabula

4400 Main Avenue Redevelopment

Issued: February 5, 2024

Due: April 19, 2024

Contacts:

James M. Timonere, City Manager
4717 Main Avenue
Ashtabula, OH 44004
Phone:(440) 992-7103
Email: jim@cityofashtabula.com

City Hall will be moving! Prior to sending your RFP/RFQ, please call (440) 992-7183 for the correct address if applicable.

Mary Church, Assistant Director
Planning & Community Development
4717 Main Avenue
Ashtabula, OH 44004
Phone:(440) 992-7118
Email: mchurch@cityofashtabula.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Summary..... 4

Introduction..... 5

 Purpose of RFQ/RFP 5

 Background: Ashtabula Main Ave. District Neighborhood..... 5

 Surrounding Economy 7

 Project Area Overview..... 7

 Purchase Price 8

Project Goals..... 8

Submittal Requirements..... 8

 Format Requirements of Submittals..... 9

 Consideration of Qualification Submittals 10

 Addendums & Clarification of Proposals 10

Evaluation Criteria..... 10

 Development Team..... 10

 Experience to Successfully Undertake this Project..... 10

 Project Understanding and Approach..... 11

Pre-Proposal Conference 11

Project Schedule 11

General Information..... 11

 Inquiries..... 11

 Withdrawal or Revisions to Proposal..... 11

 Public Information..... 11

 Process & Right to Reject..... 11

 Expenses of Submission..... 11

 Public Disclosure..... 12

SUMMARY

RFQ/RFP – RFP TITLE	4400 Main Avenue Redevelopment
DEADLINE FOR SUBMISSIONS	April 19, 2024 4:00 P.M.
SUBMIT TO:	City of Ashtabula Attn: City Manager’s Office 4717 Main Avenue, 2 nd Floor Ashtabula, OH 44004
LABELING	All submissions must be packaged, sealed, and clearly labeled. Proposer’s Name and Address TITLE: 4400 Main Avenue Redevelopment
DIRECT ALL INQUIRIES TO:	James Timonere, City Manager jim@cityofashtabula.com
FORMAT OF SUBMITTALS	Three (3) hardcopy submissions on 8.5 by 11-inch paper and one (1) electronic copy identical to the hardcopy version in searchable .pdf format. The body of the Statement of Qualifications shall be organized in accordance with the Evaluation Criteria.



INTRODUCTION

Purpose of RFQ/RFP

The City of Ashtabula (City) is seeking statements of qualifications and proposals (RFQ/RFP) from real estate developers / development teams to redevelop the former Municipal Building located at 4400 Main Avenue in the City's Downtown District.

The objective from the City's perspective is to initiate a document which will serve to steer all parties on the path to agreement on the specifics of this project and transaction. This is expected to be an interactive, conversational process, with the Proposal used as a foundation.

The City owns the building and seeks to sell the property for redevelopment. Responses to this RFQ/RFP will be used as part of a multi-phase selection process.

The RFQ/RFP is intended to reach a broad cross section of interested parties with ideas and comparable experience in building program, renovation, and/or operations as a means to identify the most capable entities (or team members) from a real estate and operations standpoint. The RFQ/RFP is intended to qualify respondents as well as allow for the submission of technical and price proposals for the project development.

The RFQ/RFP evaluation will involve scrutiny of the Responder's ability to implement the Project in a timely way, the program concept, and a finance plan that addresses sources and uses of funds sufficient to the building improvements and to sustain the building's operation, as well as other criteria to be outlined in this request. At the conclusion of this step, the City will invite a proposer to negotiate and enter into a development agreement with the City.

Within a specified period of time, the City will negotiate and execute a development agreement for the project, with the selected Developer who would redevelop, and thereafter operate, maintain, and own the Property.

The following is information on the City's goals for the project, specifications, and terms of the project, RFQ/RFP submission requirements, and evaluation and selection criteria.

Background: 4400 Main Avenue

The Property may contain environmental hazards that will need to be remediated at the sole costs and expense of the selected development team. The City does not make any representation, guaranty or warranty concerning the possible presence of hazardous materials.

The following information is taken from the National Register of Historic Places Registration form for this building:

The Ashtabula Post Office/Municipal Building, located at 4400 Main Avenue in Ashtabula, Ohio, is a U-shaped building that occupies the northeast corner of West 44th Street and Main Avenue. The building, designed in the Beaux Arts architectural style, is two stories high with a raised basement, and is constructed in brick with stone and terra cotta accents and features. It was designed through the office of James Knox Taylor, supervising architect of the United States Treasury. Located in the heart of Ashtabula's downtown adjacent to a commercial district primarily built in the late 19th-early 20th

century, it was built in 1910 as the Ashtabula Post Office and Federal Building, and renovated in 1965, when it became the Ashtabula Municipal Building. Despite its condition, the Ashtabula Post Office and Municipal Building has a substantial amount of historic material remaining, especially on its exterior, and has historic integrity.

Exterior

The building consists of two stories and a raised basement. The building follows a U-shaped plan. The building sits on a granite stone block foundation slightly flared toward the base. The building's masonry consists of blond glazed bricks laid in a stretcher bond, and the roof on the original building is flat and consists of rolled bitumen.

The façade faces west toward Main Avenue. The raised basement features deeply recessed rectangular windows covered with steel bars. Most of the basement windows are original to the building. A projecting portico leads to the front entrance, with two sets of concrete steps on either side. Between the steps is a large marble wall with engravings that display a quote from President John F. Kennedy's 1961 inaugural address, "Ask not what your country can do for you, Ask what you can do for your country". This new entrance detail was installed in 1964-65 as part of the conversion of the building to municipal offices.

The front façade consists of five bays, with the front entrance located on the central (third) bay. Each bay is slightly recessed, giving the space between bays an appearance that resembles pilasters. The entryway is surrounded by terra cotta architrave trim topped with an escutcheon within a broken segmental pediment. Although the door itself appears to be a late 20th century aluminum replacement door, the door's sidelights and a transom with words reading "Municipal Building" are still visible. Copper light fixtures are placed on either side of the entryway. Windows on the façade's first story are 6/6 steel-framed casement windows with a four fixed pane windows above them. The windows have terra cotta architrave trim with decorative terra cotta panels underneath the sills. They also feature a decorative crown topped with either a triangular or segmental terra cotta pediment (they alternate).

In contrast, the second story windows on the façade are similar to the 6/6 casement windows on the first story, but they are not accented with fixed pane windows on top. Below all of the windows are terra cotta panels decorated with an accented floral swag. The crowns on each second story windows are topped with keystones. A belt course lines the span of the façade above the second story windows and below the cornice; they are accented by terra-cotta eagle motifs on both the north and south corners (Photo 9). Above the belt course, flush with the brickwork in the center of the entablature is a stone panel with the engraved words 'Ashtabula Municipal Building.' The cornice itself has a decorative architrave and elaborated dentils that span the entire façade.

The Ashtabula Post Office and Federal Building maintains historic integrity despite its condition issues. Classically-inspired architectural characteristics in the Ashtabula Post Office and Federal Building include its overall grandiose architectural statement displaying an exuberance of details and variety of finishes. The building largely retains its original appearance on the exterior, as well as retaining historic materials and workmanship on the exterior and interior. The brick exterior includes a granite raised foundation, alternating pediment and semi-circular terra cotta window and door surrounds spaced between brick pilasters and topped by an ornamental terra cotta entablature and brick parapet. Terra cotta medallions, eagles, and swags add to the exterior's details. The interior displays an impressive marble staircase with ornamental metal railings. Decorative plaster moldings and ceiling remnants remain above the dropped ceilings on the first floor. The Ashtabula Post Office and Federal Building is in its original location and the

setting is mostly intact, as the layout and general appearance of Ashtabula's downtown have not changed much since the end of the period of its significance, and the building also has a feeling and association as a public building. The building's placement on its site with surrounding open space and facing the city park defining the northern edge of the commercial district adds to its distinctive presence in the downtown.

The entire National Register of Historic Places Registration form is attached for your reference and more information regarding the building.

Surrounding Economy

The revitalization of Main Avenue and surrounding neighborhoods has been a priority for the city. Collaboration and investment of time and funding by the City government, philanthropic entities, private developers, and business owners has begun to change the dynamics of the commercial district. The Ashtabula Main Avenue Historic District, roughly bounded by Park Pl., Collins Blvd., W 48th St., Center St. and Park Ave. is now listed on the National Register, opening up historic funding opportunities for this project.

Notable projects in the district include the renovation of the former Ashtabula Hotel. This 6-story, 55,000 SF historical hotel building was originally built-in 1919 & underwent extensive exterior and interior renovations to house the building's new tenant, Signature Health, Inc. To offset the \$5.2 million in development costs, the project received \$1.2 million in federal and state historic tax credits. This is also the largest historic redevelopment and adaptive reuse project in Ashtabula County's history.

The Castle Block project is multi-phased and includes new apartments, renovation of the retail spaces, demolition of an existing house, a parking lot and site development. The property is also on the National Register of Historic Places and obtained state and federal historic tax credits.

A project in process is the Carlisle-Allen Building and Masonic Temple on Main Avenue. The rehabilitation of the 5 story, 150,000+ SF building complex is on the National Register of Historic Places and the developers are working to secure state and federal tax credits and prepare other grant applications.

Just outside the District on the site of the former Chestnut Elementary School, a Senior Housing Development, Chestnut Village, consisting of 32 units is under construction with an anticipated completion date in 2024.

Lastly, the District's newest tenant, Dollar General Market, is an approximately 12,000 sq/ft grocery store in an area which has been a food desert for some time.

Project Area Overview

The following points summarize the site's existing conditions as shown on the map on the following page.

- The project area under control is a .35-acre, one parcel site.
- Parcel 052110004000 has frontage along Main Ave. and W. 44th Street. It contains the building and a small parking lot to the south with access off Main Ave.
- The site faces a city park defining the northern edge of the commercial district. This intersection is viewed as the start of the downtown district by the community.
- The site is zoned C-2, Central Business District. Please see Chapter 1131 of the City's Codified Ordinances for information on permitted uses and other regulations pertaining to this zoning

designation.

- This site is within the Ashtabula Main Avenue Historic District. This designation’s objective is to preserve the character of the District. Designs are subject to the Historic Preservation Commission.

Purchase Price

The proposal should delineate a threshold cost the Responder is willing to pay for the site. No brokerage fees will be paid. The City is willing to think creatively about the deal structure to mitigate its expenses and ensure there is sufficient profit for the Responder to justify the project.

PROJECT GOALS

The project area represents a significant opportunity to improve a cornerstone of the Main Avenue Historic District and foster stabilization on residential streets immediately adjacent to a healthy commercial district. It will add tax revenue to the community and attract additional development to the Main Avenue District.

The project goals are:

- **Preservation of the Historic Building:** The community supports historic preservation and has for years wanted to see this building repurposed.
- **Economic Development:** Private redevelopment of this building will add to the tax base of the City and stimulate economic activity in the Main Avenue District.
- **Infill development with quality, thoughtful urban neighborhood design:** Ensuring that the final product fits the fabric of the Historic District is essential. Consideration should be given to the fact Main Avenue has a mix of property uses including residential and commercial purposes.

SUBMITTAL REQUIREMENTS

All submittals shall address the **PROJECT GOALS** and include the information in the order listed below. Note that a detailed development plan is not being requested as this stage, only a general description of the types of uses and general character/function of the development that the team would explore for the site. Examples of other projects should be included but please do not include specific development plans for this site.

Cover Include project name, respondent name and date

Section 1 Cover Letter – Introductory cover letter identifying the lead firm, contact information for the proposed project manager, and a statement that the respondent has reviewed this RFQ/RFP including a list of all specific addendums that the City may subsequently issue.

Section 2 Development Team Organization – Overview of the development team organization. Provide an organization chart for all phases of a project, from design through final acceptance and warranty and maintenance period(s). Please identify specific individuals for key functions and show interrelationships and reporting hierarchy. Note whether individuals are performing multiple functions. At a minimum, identify the key team members and provide resumes for each.

Section 3 Summary of Qualifications – Statement of project understanding and summary of qualifications and approach to perform the work and meet the City’s goals based on the development team’s skills and experiences.

Section 4 Relevant Experience – Descriptions of no more than three comparable projects. Each description should generally include the following:

- Name, location and description of the type of project including project size
- Project partners
- Project construction budget and sources of financing
- Description of project deliverables for each project
- Description of any specialized software that would be used by the team.
- Project start and end dates
- At least one reference with contact information

Section 5 Financial Capabilities – Lists and contact information for the following

- Private sources of financing used for recent projects
- Public sources of financing/incentives used for recent projects
- Past bankruptcies or pending financial litigation involving any team firm or principal

Section 6 Project Proposed

- Project narrative discussing the details of the proposed project and how the project relates to the various parameters described herein
- Preliminary architectural plans, elevations, and site plan
- Offering Price, Financing Strategy, and any requests for aid in financing or remediation cost reimbursement needs.
- Project Schedule

Format Requirements of Submittals

Pages shall be formatted in 8 ½” x 11” with limited use of 11”x17” foldouts as may be necessary to accommodate graphics.

Qualifications are due at the City Manager’s Office by **April 19, 2024, by 4:00pm**. Responses and their envelopes should be clearly marked with the name and address of the respondent and the project title. Submit three hard copies and one pdf electronic file to:

City of Ashtabula
City Manager’s Office, 2nd Floor
4147 Main Avenue, Ashtabula, Ohio 44004
Email: jim@cityofashtabula.com
Project Title: 4400 Main Avenue Project

City Hall will be moving! Prior to sending your RFP/RFQ, please call (440) 992-7183 for the correct address if applicable.

The City reserves without limitation, and may exercise at its sole discretion, the following rights and conditions with regard to this May 13, 2024:

1. To cancel the process and reject any and all Statements of Qualification and/or proposals;
2. To waive any informality or irregularity;
3. To revise the Request for Qualifications via an Addendum;
4. To reject submittals that fail to contain all required information or fail to follow all of the instructions contained in this RFQ/RFP;

5. To require confirmation of information furnished by submission, require additional information from a responder concerning its submission or proposal and require additional evidence of qualifications to perform the work described in this RFQ/RFP or a subsequent RFP;
6. To provide clarifications or conduct discussions, at any time, with one or more responder;
7. To contact references who are not listed in the submitted Statement of Qualifications and investigate statements in the Statement of Qualifications;
8. To take any action affecting the Request for Qualification and Request for Proposal process, or the project that is determined to be in the City's best interests; and
9. Approve or disapprove of the use of particular subconsultants, subcontractors, or key team members and/or substitutions and/or changes to those identified in the Statement of Qualifications or proposal. Such approval or disapproval shall not be unreasonably exercised; and
10. To award more points to relevant experience/comparable projects that have similar characteristics; and
11. To award more points to successful projects in which the Responder, team members, and/or individual key team members had substantial responsibility for their respective scopes of work.

Consideration of Qualification & Proposal Submittals

Qualifications and Proposals will be reviewed by a review committee which may include the City Manager, the Assistant Director of Community Planning and Development and possibly members of City Council, the business community and the community at large. The committee will make the final selection and recommendations. Interviews may be conducted during this RFQ/RFP process.

The committee will assess each submittal against the criteria listed in the following section, **EVALUATION CRITERIA**. In making a selection under this RFQ/RFP, the Committee will consider responses, interviews, general qualifications, project history, Project proposal and the evaluation criteria set forth in this RFQ/RFP.

Clarifications of Submittals

During the evaluation of submittals, the City reserves the right to contact a respondent to request additional information for purposes of clarification of RFQ/RFP responses, reject submittals which contain errors, or at its sole discretion, waive disqualifying errors or gain clarification of error or information.

EVALUATION CRITERIA

The following criteria will be assessed by the review committee.

- I. Development Team
 - a) Years and types of experience in the field
 - b) Diversity of services provided including real estate development and marketing, design/architecture, landscape architecture, engineering, and construction
 - c) Financial capability to complete the project
 - d) Professional and project references
- II. Experience to successfully undertake this project
 - a) Experience with similar redevelopment

b) Proven capacity to deliver the project requirements on time and on budget

III. Project understanding and approach

- a) Understanding of City’s goals and desires for the project
- b) Approach to evaluating the market and determining the product type and possible mix
- c) Approach to working with the City in crafting an ultimate plan
- d) Approach to project financing and determining use of incentives

PRE-PROPOSAL QUESTIONS

The City will entertain pre-proposal questions received in email to jim@cityofashtabula.com from issuance of this RFQ/RFP till April 29, 2024 and will respond to all questions to the best of its ability by May 3rd. The City may enable walk-throughs of the existing building on the property upon request.

PROJECT SCHEDULE

The tentative schedule the City intends to follow in identifying qualified developers, soliciting proposals from them, and negotiating a specific redevelopment project is below. The City reserves the right to alter this schedule at any time, with or without prior notice.

February 5, 2024: Issue Request for Qualification & Proposals
April 19, 2024: Due Date for RFP Process
May 17, 2024: Award project, commence transaction details

GENERAL INFORMATION

Inquiries

All inquiries related to this RFQ/RFP are to be directed, in writing, to the contact persons at the email addresses on the front cover of this RFQ/RFP.

Withdrawal or Revisions to Submittal

Any submittal may be withdrawn by written notice to the City any time prior to the date and time specified for submittal. Such notice of withdrawal shall be in writing to the contact individual provided. Any respondent may modify their submittal prior to the date and time specified for submittal by email communication to the contact individual.

Public Information

All information submitted in response to this RFQ/RFP may be made available for public inspection according to public records laws of the State of Ohio.

Process & Right to Reject

The RFQ/RFP process is non-binding, does not imply a commitment to move forward with the project and is subject to the Codified Ordinances of the City of Ashtabula and the laws of the State of Ohio. The City reserves the right to discontinue the RFQ/RFP process at any time.

Expenses of submissions

City accepts no liability for the costs and expenses incurred by firms in responding to this RFQ/RFP. Each

responder that enters into the process shall prepare the required materials, the Statement of Qualifications, and the Proposal at its own expense and with the express understanding that the City cannot make any claims whatsoever for reimbursement for the costs and expenses associated with the process, even in the event the City cancels the project or rejects all proposals.

Public Disclosure

All documentation and submittals provided to the City may be considered public documents under applicable laws and may be subject to disclosure. Responders recognize and agree that the City will not be responsible or liable in any way for any losses that the Responder may suffer from the lawful disclosure of information or materials to third parties. Any materials requested to be treated as confidential documents, proprietary information, or trade secrets must be clearly identified and readily separable from the balance of the Statement of Qualifications or proposal. Such designations will not necessarily be conclusive, and Responders may be required to justify why such material should not, upon written request, be disclosed by the City under the applicable public records act. The City will endeavor to provide at least two (2) business days' notice of a public records request for material submitted pursuant to this RFQ/RFP. Responders must reply to the notice in writing with any objection to the production of the documents within two (2) business days of receipt of the notice. All costs incurred by Responders associated with any public records request are the responsibility of the Responder.